

Follow-Up To Graduates Of The Bachelor's Degree In English Language At The Universidad Autónoma Del Estado De Quintana Roo: Analysis Of Program Design

Vilma Esperanza Portillo Campos¹ José Alejandro Paredes Anguas²
María de Lourdes Gutiérrez Aceves³

¹Department of Humanities and Languages, Universidad Autónoma del Estado de Quintana Roo, México

² Universidad Autónoma del Estado de Quintana Roo, México

³ Faculty of Languages, Universidad Autónoma de Chiapas, México

ABSTRACT

Background: The main objective of the follow-up of graduates of the Bachelor's Degree in English Language of the Universidad Autónoma del Estado de Quintana Roo (UAEQROO) was to analyze the professional development, experience, and placement in the labor market of former students.

Methodology: The qualitative study focused on the analysis of the design of the academic program, for which the methodology proposed by the Evaluation and Performance Unit of the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit, which consists of four processes, was adapted. This work was specifically based on the design, which made it possible to evaluate the 2015 program, which was contrasted with public policies, the education law, the opinion of former students and employers, as well as the analysis of the needs of the labor market.

Results: Among the results we can observe that only one of the graduates of the 2015 program worked as an English teacher, so these data suggest reorienting the courses towards the educational sector with the highest demand for English teachers.

Key words: Graduate follow-up, English, educational program design.

Date of Submission: 08-08-2023

Date of Acceptance: 18-08-2023

I. Introduction

Higher education institutions carry out graduate studies because they are an instrument used to evaluate the impacts and needs of professionals in the field of training. These analyses allow universities to comply with the provisions of Section II of Article 1 of the General Law of Higher Education, whose essence is to contribute to the social, cultural, scientific, technological, humanistic, productive, and economic development of the country through the training of people with creative, innovative, and entrepreneurial capacity with a high social commitment to serve the nation and society through knowledge acquired in a degree and provided by a curriculum. Thus, graduate follow-up studies allow to analyze if the academic program is achieving the objectives of training professionals that will have an impact on the labor and scientific market.

The UAEQROO has expressed the need to conduct studies of graduates, which is reflected in the document Program of Studies of the Bachelor's Degree in English Language (2015), pointing out that there is a lack of information on studies of graduates from similar and existing programs that show a general estimate of the integration of the graduate in the labor market. Thus, Gutiérrez, Díaz and Chang (2021) from the Universidad Autónoma de Chiapas (UNACH) published a study under the theories of human capital using the methodology proposed by the Inter-Institutional Committees for the Evaluation of Higher Education (CIEES), as well as other studies about graduates from other programs, which show the opportunity to generate graduate study strategies by analyzing the design and impact of an academic program to determine the level of alignment with public policies and the needs of the National Education System.

The present follow-up study of English Language graduates of the UAEQROO Campus Cozumel takes as a reference for analysis the academic program modified in 2015 whose curriculum orientation was to generate a graduate profile to train English teachers for all educational levels. Now, does the curriculum of this program really train English teachers for all levels? does it meet the needs of the labor field? can graduates be inserted in the labor field without problems?, these are the questions that arose from an initial analysis of public policies, the education law and the emergence of the New Mexican School, as well as the number of graduates working as English teachers in the schools of Cozumel.

The objective of the research is to analyze the professional development, experience, and integration in the labor market of graduates of the Bachelor's Degree in English Language of UAEQROO Cozumel, using as a point of contrast the design of the 2015 academic program of this degree. Therefore, to carried out the analysis it was necessary to adapt the methodology proposed by the Evaluation and Performance Unit of the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit composed of four evaluations: design, process, consistency of results and impact which were addressed under the theory of change, the results-based model, and the competencies.

The follow-up of English Language graduates based on the analysis of the design of the academic program, has allowed to obtain evidence of the labor record of the graduates, which is explained in detail in the information analysis section of this paper. Likewise, it has allowed to observe the professional development needs that the 2015 program does not include in the curriculum and that it will be necessary to readapt or restructure according to the training demands required by the National Education System. Regarding the labor record of the graduates, it can be noted based on the results of the interviews and on the direct observation in the schools of Cozumel together with the information from the educational authorities, that most of the graduates of the 2015 program work in the tourism field.

Theoretical Framework

The follow-up of graduates is a topic that has been widely studied from different perspectives (Sánchez, Zermeño and Preciado, 2016), (Cabrera, Desertes, and Bradford, 2003). The studies carried out in different theories and conceptual frameworks seek to explain the integration and labor performance of a graduate, which also are used to evaluate the academic program. From the above there is a wide coincidence in the objectives of works such as those of Murray (1994), Ramírez Romero (2011), Cruz and Pinto Pérez (2020).

Public universities carry out graduates' follow-up studies as part of the fulfillment of their obligations established in the General Law of Higher Education. They usually apply a survey to find out where their graduates are working, if they are working in the degree program they studied, their economic or income level, the time it took them to get a job, their satisfaction with the degree program and the university, among other questions. As far as we have been able to investigate, we have not found any research that analyzes the follow-up of graduates considering the design of the academic program under the paradigm of the results model. Recently, a study of graduates from the Faculty of Languages of the UNACH was published in which a follow-up study of graduates was addressed but using the theories of human capital and emerging approaches (Gutiérrez, Díaz and Chang, 2021).

Table 1 shows the conclusions of studies on the follow-up of graduates from different universities. This shows how the lines of research are oriented toward generating information to justify changes in the curriculum.

Table 1: Results of research on graduates' follow-up.

Murray (1994)	The achievement of graduates of a university degree can be used to make a curricular change or reform (pg. 59 article on graduate survey).
Bok & Bowen (1998)	There is positive impact when graduates become involved in activities such as professional associations, political clubs, national charities, etc. (pg. 59 alumni survey article).
Bok and Bowen (1999)	Assessing the involvement of graduates in social activities. Supported by the Institute for Research on Higher Education.
Pike (1990)	Graduates who were satisfied with their job and working conditions rated their college experiences positively, and those who were not satisfied tended to rate them negatively.
Pascarella (2001)	Graduates acquire critical skills while in college. Defining these skills and establishing their connection to specific campus practices are issues that have yet to be resolved.
Astin, (1993), Ewell, (1996), Pascarella (2002), Kuh (2003)	To assessment method and factors show to have great impact on a student's development, learning, and skill acquisition.

Among the purposes that have been found to follow up graduates in a common way in public universities, is to obtain or ratify the CIEES certifications, probably this is the reason why institutions use the questionnaires of this evaluation institution to follow up alumni. Furthermore, after knowing several of its results, we consider that the CIEES does not evaluate academic programs in depth, which is why this paper has chosen to test the methodology of the Evaluation and Performance Unit of the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit, which consists of analyzing the design, processes, consistency, results, and impact of the English Language program.

The methodology is based on the theory of change from which the results model emerges. The theory of change proposed by Rogers (2014) explains how activities produce a series of results that contribute to achieving the final intended impacts. This can be applied to any level of intervention, whether it is an event, a project, a program, a policy, a strategy, or an organization.

According to Rogers (2014), the theory of change is applicable when the activities of a program or intervention can be identified and planned, when such intervention adapts to problems and to new problems and decisions, as is the case of the English Language program which was analyzed to determine if it currently meets the needs of the labor field and the development of graduates.

Graduates' follow-up studies in Mexico

The graduates' follow-up studies implemented by universities in Mexico have a dual purpose, the first one is to establish contact with the graduate to know the effectiveness of the degree programs. This information leads to the second purpose which is based on the General Law of Higher Education published in the Official Gazette of the Federation (DOF) on April 20, 2021, in sections XI, XII, XIII of Article 10 regarding the criteria for developing higher education policies. Considering in these sections the evaluation of programs as an integral, systematic, and participatory process for continuous improvement, among other aspects related to the linkage of higher education institutions with social environments, as well as the promotion and participation with the productive and service sectors.

In Mexico, some institutions that have a follow-up program are the Universities of Guadalajara, Colima, Tlaxcala, Guanajuato, as well as the Autonomous University of Queretaro, the Autonomous University of Tamaulipas, the Autonomous University of Nuevo Leon, and the Autonomous University of Coahuila (Nigrini and Petito, 2003).

One of the works on graduates carried out in Mexico is that of Sánchez et al. (2016) who proposed a study whose objective was to estimate the determinants of educational satisfaction of graduates for which a survey was applied to graduates of the undergraduate and graduate programs of the University of Colima in 2015. It was concluded that employment is related to satisfaction and to the development of generic and specific competencies.

Therefore, the National Association of Universities and Institutions of Higher Education (ANUIES, 1998) points out that higher education institutions do not frequently carry out these studies because they usually do not have a database to locate their graduates, and they lack experts to carry out the research. In addition, they do not have a clear methodology; each institution does it in its own way and often lacks a design to measure the impact of the programs, which results in insufficient budget to carry out this activity.

II. Methodology

The objective of this research focuses on exploring the professional development, experience, and integration to the labor market of English Language graduates of UAEQROO Cozumel based on the analysis of the design of the 2015 program. The methodological approach is qualitative, using observation, direct or in-depth interviews to obtain information and data from graduates used to analyze and contrast the teaching program, subjects, and processes of the English Language program whose graduate profile is to train English teachers.

To analyze the design of the English Language program to get evidence about the professional development and the integration of the graduates in the labor field, we carried interviews with graduates, and analyzed the opinion of the main employer in the state, the 2015 academic program, the national and state public policies, and the Law of Basic and Higher Education. This is innovative given that most quantitative studies make use of surveys in which they limit themselves to obtaining the perception of graduates and employers.

Thus, in this research the English Language program is contrasted with public policies, laws and the needs of the labor field, institutional and field information, and the job placement of graduates.

It is applicable to this type of research the methodological processes of the Evaluation and Performance Unit of the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit usually used to evaluate budgetary programs in the public administration through the design, processes, consistency of results and impact under the results-based budget model, which will surely in the not-too-distant future be the way to evaluate the results of educational programs. Public universities are autonomous institutions within the structure of public administration; therefore, the main employer of English Language graduates is the National Education System, which is composed of the Ministry of Public Education and the Ministry of Education of the State of Quintana Roo.

The methodological process is divided into four parts: the interview with graduates, the opinion of employers, the design of the university's academic program, and the analysis of public policies and the curriculum.

III. Results and discussion

Interviewing graduates

The interview with graduates was conducted by means of a semi-structured questionnaire of five questions, in which we asked the interviewee to answer about the generation to which he/she belongs, his/her form of getting the degree, activity, time working in the current job and the perception of his/her income. This was the starting point for graduates to have the opportunity to speak in more detail about how the degree program and the subjects of the curricular content are helping him/her to develop his/her activity as a teacher or as a service provider in different areas of the tourism sector.

According to the Secretariat of Extension and Liaison of the UAEQROO, in the period from 2015 to 2023 in the Academic Campus Cozumel there are 133 graduates of English Language, of which thirteen people were interviewed, the majority belong to enrollments of the 1995 program, but who completed the program in the period of analysis of this work, providing the results shown in Table 2.

Table 2: Interview with UAEQROO English Language Graduates

GRADUATE	GENERATION	FORM OF GETTING THE DEGREE	ACTIVITY PERFORMED	WORKING TIME	INCOME EARNED
1	2010-2014	Thesis	Primary English teacher	8 years	Satisfactory
2	2011-2015	Thesis	Tourist attraction operations manager	5 years	Always looking for more income
3	2012-2016	None	English teacher in primary English program	5 years	Very good.
4	2013-2017	Thesis	Public secondary and upper secondary English teacher	6 years	More than three times the minimum wage is enough to save
5	2014-2018	Thesis	Call center and occasional teacher	4 years	Interesting
6	2015-2019	Thesis	Teacher at the upper secondary level	5 years	It is a place with very good benefits
7	2016-2020	Thesis	Secondary school and university subject teacher	4 years	Earns well
8	2017-2021	Thesis	Tourist service provider	1 year	I'm just starting out and I think it's very good
9	2018-2022	Thesis	Draftsman in design consultancy	2 years	It is an acceptable income
10	2009-2013	Thesis	English teacher at high school and university level	8 years	It is an income
11	2009-2015	Thesis	Freelance English teacher and translator	7 years	Excellent
12	2008-2012	None	International Diving Instructor	15 years	More than three minimum wages plus tips
13	2004-2009	Average	Lecturer at a university	10 years	More than three minimum wages per day

Of the thirteen graduates interviewed, eight of them have teaching as their main activity. Most of them, according to the comments made, given the shortage of English teachers, have been able to work in two different schools, who point out that there are opportunities, but the main requirements are teaching experience and the National Language Level Certification (CENNI) level 12, mainly equivalent to B2. They also comment that their advantage was that they started working as English teachers from mid-career in private schools and in the National English Program (PRONI) when the requirement was not so demanding, but they had the opportunity to prepare themselves and, eventually, fulfill these requirements. They added that the PRONI provided them with training related to pedagogy and preparation for international exams.

The graduates stated that the English Language curriculum they studied included 8 levels of English and 95% of the subjects were in English, which allowed them to obtain oral and written skills. During the course they learned about the levels they had to reach from A1, A2, B1, B2, C1, and the PET, FCE, CAE exams, but almost nothing was taught about the CENNI. It was until they started working in PRONI and in private schools that they were aware of the need for CENNI, given that it is a legal requirement to be an English teacher.

The graduates who took the 1995 program point out that the subjects were rich in philosophical and literary content; there were two literature subjects that provided them with knowledge of universal literature, and other subjects such as morphology and semantics, from which they claimed they learned discourse and language skills in context and this helped them to solve conflicts in their workplaces; however in the curricular content of the 2015 English Language program, most of these subjects are not included.

As for the second opinion regarding the program, the graduates of the 2015 program point out that the 8 levels of English provided them with linguistic skills and that has had an impact on their abilities to speak, listen, read, and write in English, however with respect to the content this was not related to the teaching activity. They had subjects related to the teaching, but they did not have teaching practice in preschool, elementary, middle, and high school. This causes them to have few skills to establish group control, lack of knowledge of the curricular program and lack of strength in pedagogical skills, being some of the deficiencies that have been observed when they start teaching.

The teachers interviewed who work in elementary school indicated that the strategies and contents for preschool, elementary and high school where they have had the opportunity to provide their services are very different from each other and stated that the 2015 program lacks this information. Even the planning and contents are different because in the case of preschool it involves a working relationship directly with parents. The above falls within the management skills subjects that the program must have, but it lacks this content.

Table 2 shows the interview with graduates, five of them are engaged in activities other than teaching, the first interviewed indicated that since he started the English program he was already engaged in diving and the

other one in the activity of restaurant management. Undoubtedly, both agree that while studying they learned academic English that allows them to communicate clearly with English-speaking customers.

Graduates also commented that morphology, grammar, discourse analysis and semantics, have provided them with tools to solve problems with customers or tourists of a high cultural level.

Employer opinion analysis

The main employer of English Language graduates is the National Education System, which is divided into general directorates of preschool, elementary, secondary, and high school. Its evaluation criteria are based on a series of processes supported by a legal framework.

The teacher hiring process is carried out through the results of the evaluation applied by USICAMM (United System for the Career of Teachers), which issues annual calls to obtain teaching positions at the secondary and high school levels. As for the preschool and elementary school levels, the Educational Program does not include English as one of the subjects in its curriculum. That's the reason why the PRONI was created to hire teachers per school period to teach these levels.

English teachers who get a position or are hired by periods are under the supervision of the principals of secondaries and high school schools. Preschool and elementary English teachers are evaluated by PRONI, the directors are only in charge of attendance control.

Thus, to determine the performance of English Language graduates, it is important to analyze in which schools and shifts they are working, the number of students and groups that each one attends, and how many graduates work in the educational system.

In the thirteen preschools of Cozumel, there are no English graduates working at PRONI. The coordination of the program indicates that before the pandemic they had coverage in 50% of these schools, attending third grade students. As part of the information used to analyze the design and impact of the English Language program, it is registered that this level has 89 groups and a total of 2,593 students. These figures represent a point of interest for orienting the subjects of the English Language program, specifically subjects that link the processes of teaching English at the preschool level.

Table 3: Cozumel public elementary schools with UAEQROO English teachers.

SHIFT	EDUCATIONAL CENTER	TOTAL NUMBER OF ENGLISH TEACHERS	TOTAL OF UAEQROO ENGLISH TEACHERS	GROUPS ATTENDED BY UAEQROO GRADUATES	TOTAL NUMBER OF STUDENTS PER SCHOOL	TOTAL GROUPS
AFTERNOON	JOSE MA. MORELOS Y PAVON	0	0	0	319	10
MORNING	BERNARDINO MEZO MÉNDEZ	0	0	0	417	12
AFTERNOON	ANDRÉS QUINTANA ROO	1	1	6	195	7
AFTERNOON	MIGUEL HIDALGO	0	0	0	368	11
MORNING	ADELFO R. ESCALANTE	2	1	14	486	14
MORNING	LEONA VICARIO	3	1	12	627	18
MORNING	EMILIANO ZAPATA	1	0	0	417	12
MORNING	VICENTE GUERRERO	0	0	0	408	12
MORNING	BENITO JUÁREZ	2	0	0	566	16
AFTERNOON	IGNACIO ZARAGOZA	2	1	4	399	14
MORNING	ELADIO NOVELO GIL	2	1	6	426	12
MORNING	JUAN DE GRIJALVA	2	1	10	419	12
AFTERNOON	ELADIO NOVELO GIL	2	0	0	403	12
AFTERNOON	JUAN DE GRIJALVA	1	1	6	403	12
AFTERNOON	BERNARDINO MEZO MENDEZ	1	0	0	277	9
MORNING	MARIA JESÚS SANTANA PAREDES	1	1	1	269	8

AFTERNOON	MARIA JESÚS SANTANA PAREDES	2	1	4	257	8
MORNING	SARA MARÍA RIVERO NOVELO	2	1	12	400	12
MORNING	IRMA DELFINA LÓPEZ BERZUNZA	1	1	6	419	12
MORNING	JORGE MEXICO OJEDA NOVELO	0	0		425	12
AFTERNOON	JORGE MEXICO OJEDA NOVELO	1	1	6	234	8
AFTERNOON	SARA MARÍA RIVERO NOVELO	1	1	7	200	7
AFTERNOON	IRMA DELFINA LÓPEZ BERZUNZA	0	0	0	220	7
AFTERNOON	BENITO JUAREZ	1	0	0	194	7
CONTINUOUS (FULL TIME)	EDNA JULIA POLANCO MEZO	2	1	7	325	14
TOTAL		30	10	101	9073	273

The elementary level on the island of Cozumel is composed of 17 school registers, 8 operate with morning and afternoon shifts, 6 operate only in the morning shift, and 4 of them operate in the afternoon shift, serving a total of 9,073 students distributed in 273 groups. The English Language graduates of the Cozumel Campus hired by PRONI, in the 2022-2023 school year, are ten distributed in 14 schools, everyone is responsible of eight groups, teaching weekly three hours per group.

This analysis shows that the graduates attend 101 groups at this level, if each group is composed of 35 students on average, this means that about 3,535 elementary school students are attended, which represents 38% of the enrollment.

At this point of the analysis several questions arise regarding the number of graduates from the academic program modified in 2015, in which the curriculum is focused on teaching, and several subjects were added the word pedagogy for example: pedagogical grammar, academic communication in English, phonology and pedagogical phonetics, among others, and the time to finish the degree was reduced from five to four years, eliminating subjects that trained the graduate as a teacher of literature in English or Spanish.

According to data from the UAEQROO Extension and Liaison Secretariat's Alumni Follow-up Department, from 2015 to June 2023, 133 persons finished the Cozumel Campus Program from which 60 students got the degree; 25 got the degree by a good GPA or average, 14 by thesis and 10 by monograph work. On the other hand, 73 have not got the degree yet.

The elementary school principals stated that their responsibility in the English program is to keep track of the teachers' attendance; being the PRONI coordinators who evaluate and supervise the planning and classes. Their main observation is that graduates are very dynamic teachers and use technological tools, but their main difficulty is group control, pedagogical skills and the protocols derived from the regulations and laws of education, for this reason they are accompanied by the head teacher of the group.

The opinion of the main employer at the elementary level is the PRONI coordination, which states that to guarantee their permanence, teachers must comply with the CENNI 12 English level, be qualified to teach English, be registered at the Internal Revenue Service, prepare their daily class plan and schedule, comply with the recommendations derived from class supervision, attend training sessions and endorse their English certifications; therefore, the graduates who are in the program comply with these requirements.

Table 4: UAEQROO English teachers working at the secondary level.

SCHEDULE	EDUCATIONAL CENTER	TOTAL NUMBER OF ENGLISH TEACHERS	TOTAL UAEQROO TEACHERS	TOTAL NUMBER OF STUDENTS	TOTAL GROUPS
MORNING	ANDRÉS QUINTANA ROO	5	1	718	18
AFTERNOON	ANDRÉS QUINTANA ROO	5	1	550	18
MORNING	LUIS ÁLVAREZ BARRET	2	1	246	6
AFTERNOON	LUIS ÁLVAREZ BARRET	2	0	192	6
MORNING	CARLOS MONSIVAIS	4	1	680	15
MORNING	JOSÉ VASCONCELOS	5	0	744	18
AFTERNOON	JOSÉ VASCONCELOS	5	0	596	18
MORNING	OCTAVIO PAZ	3	1	691	18
TOTAL	5	31	5	4070	113

At the secondary level, enrollment is composed of 4,070 students distributed in 113 groups, in five schools, of which three have morning and afternoon shifts, and two of them have only the morning shift. In this context, according to the research conducted school by school, the table entitled *English teachers graduated from the Bachelor's Degree in English Language from UAEQROO* shows that, as of May 2023, the number of English teachers who attend 113 groups in Cozumel are 33, of which only five are graduates of UAEQROO. If we consider that the number of graduates with an English teacher profile was 133 as of June 2023, then where do English language graduates work if only ten are in primary and five in secondary schools? This leads to the following analysis considering the opinion of employers for secondary schools.

At the secondary level, teachers are hired through calls that contain the selection process for admission applied by the System Unit for the Teaching Career, which is integrated by agreements that contain the provisions, criteria, and indicators that applicants must meet to become English teachers at a basic level. In this sense, the requirements of Article 10 of the Admission Process 2023-2024 to participate or enroll in the evaluation is: to have a bachelor's degree, professional license, be in the professional profile for the subject that is aspired (in this case English Language), have the certificate of CENNI level 12, and the diploma of the teaching skills course of the New Mexican School, and the digital skills course.

The evaluation for admission to the National Education System, which is part of the employer's opinion to determine if a graduate is suitable or unsuitable to be an English teacher, is composed of multifactorial elements in which the pedagogical teacher training has a percentage of 15%, the general average of the career represents 25%, extracurricular courses 10%, teaching experience and practice has a weighting of 20%, and knowledge and skills represent 30%. With the results of the candidacies, a priority list is built, and the appointment of positions and hours will depend on the availability and needs of the schools in the state.

Thus, the processes of entry into the National Education System are part of the employer's opinion about the level of preparation of the graduates, which together with the performance of the graduates in the classroom are evaluated by the employer to issue an opinion for the permanence, and horizontal or vertical promotion of an English teacher.

Both requirements the teaching experience and the level of English to be an English teacher are probably factors that have decreased the low number of English Language graduates working in Secondary and High school, in addition to the fact that job opportunities are outside Cozumel. In the opinion of the Secondary School Principals, student enrollment is not growing fast, and groups are closing because of school dropouts, in addition to the fact that English teachers are in the half of their working lives, which reduces opportunities for graduates.

Given that the evaluation is a form of opinion of the knowledge and aptitudes that an English teacher candidate should have, it is important that those who direct the English Language program consider updating their academic programs considering the three areas that determine the suitability of an English teacher for the National Education System: the first is the philosophical, ethical and legal principles of education in Mexico, the second is the teaching and learning processes and the third is educational management that includes school organization, professional development, orientations and protocols for the wellbeing of the educational community.

Going on with analysis, at the high school level there are four schools to meet the demand, composed of 3,733 students distributed in 98 groups, at this level there are only six English teachers graduated from UAEQROO, belonging to the 1995 program.

Analysis of the design of the English Language program

To conduct the analysis of the design of the English Language program, we adapted the design evaluation processes proposed by the Evaluation and Performance Unit of the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit, which is used in the field of public administration to analyze the design of budgetary programs. In this research, the design evaluation was used to analyze the content of the English Language academic program and the curriculum. The idea is to identify if the epistemological, linguistic, and theoretical-practical content allows the goals and objectives set out in the graduate profile to be achieved. To determine this, the program and curriculum were contrasted with public policies, the General Law of Education, as well as the demand for English Language professionals required by the state's educational system.

The current English Language program at the UAEQROO Cozumel, is derived from the original 1995 program which was modified and approved by the University Council on May 11, 2015. This was the result of the Institutional Educational Model (2010), as well as the recommendations generated by the CIEES evaluations carried out in 2005 and 2010 and the consultations with students, graduates (from the 1995 program), professors and employers. Thus, with this redesign, there was the intention that the disciplinary areas of teaching and language were strengthened and updated.

Analysis of public policies

To determine whether the English Language program was aligned with national and state public policies, we considered what the Official Journal of the Federation published in December 2020 in relation to the agreement

number 28/12/20 where the rules of operation of the National English Program (PRONI) for preschool and elementary level were issued, whose plans and programs are based on the programs of the University of Cambridge. Based on this, teachers are expected to guide children to have an optimal level of English, to be able to express themselves and understand the language in a basic sense (Hernández and Villegas 2021). PRONI is included in the Education Sector Program for the period 2020 -2024, as part of the second general axis called social policy of the National Development Plan, in which education policy is articulated in six priorities, which are: education for all without leaving anyone behind, education of excellence for meaningful learning, academics as agents of educational transformation, decent educational environments and healthy coexistence, sports for all, state leadership in education and social consensus (Ministry of Public Education, 2020).

Likewise, in the curricular framework and in the 2022 Study Program, which promotes curricular autonomy in the New Mexican School specifically in the formative field of languages, the knowledge of disciplines related to the learning of Spanish, foreign languages and art as a language have been considered. These elements described above show a clear orientation of public policies to the promotion of a second language in all educational programs of the system, which is undoubtedly one of the justifications for the English Language program to maintain a dynamic training of English teachers to adapt and restructure its program of study to the needs projected in the public policy in the field of greatest demand, which is the preschool and elementary level. In this same sense, the UAEQROO should offer its graduate students' workshops on the contents of the New Mexican School.

In addition to the above, the Quintana Roo State Development Plan 2023-2027 in axis 1 Social Wellbeing and Quality of Life, and in theme 2, Education for Wellbeing, states the importance of learning English due that the state's economic activity in tourism requires people trained in different areas of knowledge with basic knowledge in English to provide the services demanded by the tourism sector. The State Development Plan recognizes that the effort to teach English in public schools is insufficient, and it is necessary to expand the coverage of the English Program in schools from preschool and elementary school, given that up to the year 2022 only 17.94% of schools were attended, which means that only 108,043 students from 238 schools in the state have benefited from PRONI.

The State Development Plan 2023-2027 states that a greater number of people with knowledge of English is required to work in the tourism field, which means that a greater number of teachers are needed. Based on the above, the UAEQROO can justify the reorientation of the content and the graduate profile of the English Language program not only to meet the needs of professionals with knowledge in English, but for the training of teachers to strengthen this policy. Therefore, the graduate profile of English Language should have as an option not only the teaching field, but a profile focused on tourism.

Analysis of the program

As part of the design, it is evaluated whether the curricular contents are related to subjects that fulfill this objective and allow to observe, in terms of the curriculum, whether the program's graduates have the knowledge, skills, and attitudes to enter the labor field or there is a lack of content that would allow them to achieve a correct integration into the field of teaching or other activities. To achieve this, the English Language program was contrasted with the needs of the basic level programs of the National Education System.

The English Language curriculum submitted for analysis corresponds to the 2015 restructured program, and the graduation profile indicates that graduates must have competencies to develop English teaching-learning processes, as well as competencies to communicate in English orally and in writing in different contexts in accordance with the Common European Framework of Reference and level 15 required by CENNI.

The curriculum is made up of 63 subjects to be taken in four years, with eight subjects per semester. The subjects of the curriculum are classified as follows:

Table 5: Classification of the English Language curriculum.

SUBJECTS	DESCRIPTION
Basic training	The basic training subjects are understood as those subjects that provide students with the ability to communicate orally and in writing.
Comprehensive training	The integral education courses are composed of subjects related to culture and sports. The purpose is that the student obtains experiences and develops competencies.
Specific training	The specific training is the disciplinary training, which is the basis of the Bachelor's Degree in English Language, where the student acquires linguistic, pragmatic and sociolinguistic skills and teaching skills
Practical training	Practical training consists of professional internships and social service, as well as degree seminars and research methods and techniques.
Multidisciplinary training	It is a set of subjects that students can take according to their interests but must adhere to strengthen the formation of the graduate profile.

The specific or disciplinary training represents 73.25% of the learning experiences to form the competencies of the graduate profile as an English teacher. This is made up of subjects that involve teacher training that compared to other programs, such as that of normal schools, English Language is limited to teaching practice 1 and 2. And the subjects for language training are aligned to obtain an advanced level of English, which is one of the strengths of the program, therefore, derived from the results that show that the greatest demand for English teachers are at the basic levels, the UAEQROO should consider to include subjects that address issues of the New Mexican School.

One evidence to determine whether the design of the English Language academic program meets the requirements of the National Education System to fulfill the demand for English teachers at the preschool and elementary level is the professional profile required in the call for teachers issued by the USICAMM 2023-2024. The preschool and elementary level does not include the bachelor's degree in English Language in its list of professional profiles; it only includes the bachelor's degrees related to education with a major in English, English pedagogy and eight other profiles.

However, at the secondary level, the bachelor's degree in English Language is included in the list of professional profiles, also highlighting the bachelor's degrees in secondary English teaching offered by some of the country's teacher training schools. A review of the curriculums of these bachelor's degrees included in the profile shows that they have eight subjects focused on teaching practice and strategies, as well as one subject focused on the legal foundations of education.

At the high school level, the professional profile of the call for admission USICAMM 2023-2024 includes the English Language profile to teach English as a second language, communication, and literature, even though there is a broader field. At this level, there are only six UAEQROO graduates teaching given that enrollment is stable and the upper secondary English teachers who have the positions are a quarter of their working lives away.

With the present analysis, it is deduced that the design of the English Language program lacks subjects focused on the practice of teaching at all levels, especially at the basic level, as well as subjects related to the legal regulations of education in Mexico. The lack of these subjects is one of the reasons why from 133 graduates, only ten are working in the PRONI, five in secondary and six in high school. It should be clarified that all of them were trained with the 1995 program. According to the research data until spring and summer of 2023 there was only one graduate of the 2015 program working as an English teacher, therefore, the majority of them are in the field of tourism.

III. Conclusions

The objective of the research on the follow-up of English Language graduates of UAEQROO was to analyze the design of the academic program restructured in 2015, from which the curriculum was oriented for a graduate profile as an English teacher for all educational levels. For this purpose, the methodology proposed by the Evaluation and Performance Unit of the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit was adapted, which is integrated by the design, process, consistency and results and impact evaluations. This work focused on the design evaluation of the English language program, leaving the other three evaluations for future research. The conceptual framework of the work is based on the theory of change, the results-based model, and the competency-based educational model.

The main conclusions derived from the analysis of the design of the academic program and in compliance with the processes described in the methodology. It can be concluded that the contribution of English Language program to the professional development of the graduate is not limited to the field of teaching, it also generates opportunities to work in other areas, like tourism. The interviewees consider that they have opportunities to develop professionally because of their communication skills in English acquired during their studies. Those who were trained with the 1995 program and graduated more than six years ago are currently working in different positions in tourism, pointed out that subjects such as semantics, literature and morphology have given them the tools to analyze the client's discourse with a high intellectual level and to solve problems.

It is important to highlight in this conclusion that those who graduated between 2015 and 2023 and who work as teachers at the elementary and high school level were trained with the 1995 program. The interviewees trained with the 2015 program who graduated as of 2021, work in the tourism sector, two of them have worked at least for one semester in private schools. They point out that during the career they did not have practice at the preschool, elementary, middle school and high school level and state that this was probably due to issues of the pandemic. From the review of the 2015 program, specifically in the disciplinary training subjects, there are only two subjects focused directly on teaching and these are Teaching Practices 1 and 2.

It is recommended that those who direct the 2015 English Language program reinforce the subjects of English teacher training at the basic level, to negotiate agreements with public and private schools so that their students, during their studies and during their social service, can carry out internships and practices in teaching and learning English in front of a group. Likewise, it is important to include courses or workshops on the New

Mexican School, so that this degree is adjusted to the guidelines established in Article 1 of Section II of the General Law of Higher Education, public policies and the National and State Development Plan which emphasizes the need to train professionals with knowledge or skills to communicate so to comply with this teacher are required.

The follow-up of graduates from the perspective of results-based design implied submitting the English Language program to analysis. In this sense, the employer's opinion is fundamental to evaluate the outcome of the academic program. In this context, the employer, Servicios Educativos de Quintana Roo (Educative Services of Quintana Roo) issues its opinion through a process established in a structure founded and motivated by the Political Constitution of the United Mexican States, the General Law of the System for the Career of Teachers and the Law of Education of the State of Quintana Roo; which in our opinion as researchers it is reliable, since it proposes the rules based on the training needs of the professionals required, and establishes the indicators and parameters in order to have teachers with the knowledge, skills and aptitudes to contribute to the integral development and learning achievement of their students (Servicios Educativos de Quintana Roo, 2023). Thus, the requirements to enter the secondary and high school levels as an English teacher is to have a degree in English Language and English level CENNI 12.

The evaluation to enter the educational system in reference to the employer's opinion measures the teaching skills and knowledge, it also provides the teaching experience and practice a value of 20%. When contrasting the academic program of English Language, it can be observed that the content of the 2015 curriculum has very few practice-oriented subjects that allow the graduates to achieve the objectives so that they can get a permanent position at the Educational System. There are no subjects focused on learning the curriculum of the preschool, primary and secondary levels, as well as subjects that have as content the education law and secretarial agreements.

In addition, the curricular content does not include subjects for the development of teaching and learning strategies at the basic level, as well as hours of group practice. Likewise, in the review of the profiles of full-time and part-time teachers at the UAEQROO, it was not found that they have experience at this level. They usually have specialized postgraduate degrees in linguistics, translation, and interpretation, but not in pedagogy, teaching or education.

The main educational implications of the results of this research are based on the methodological proposal based on the theory of change, which gives rise to the results-based model in which, from the analysis of the design of the academic program, it can be determined that the English Language program requires modifications in the graduate profile, considering at least two focuses: the first would be training to work in the field of customer service, and management of tourism organizations, and the second with the graduate profile as teachers of English in the National Education System at the basic and higher levels, for which the English Language Program at UAEQROO should reorganize the subjects, orienting them to the teaching-learning processes at the basic level, since in this way the job market is broader for graduates.

The most representative limitation of the research work is of a methodological nature, specifically in the location and availability of the graduates to participate in the interview. In this sense, the efforts to locate the graduates from 2015 to 2022 who studied the 1995 program was not so complex given that some of them work in the English Program, on the other hand, the graduates of the 2015 program were more complex to locate, given that most of them work in tourism in discontinuous schedules and others are working in other cities. Secondly, it is important to state that this research work is pending to address the part of the methodology related to the processes, consistency, and results, as well as the impact of the program.

As a result of the limitations and the results presented, it is proposed as future lines of research, to maintain contact and continue with the location of graduates of the 2015 program to elaborate the analysis of processes, the consistency of results and the impact of said program. It is also proposed to use the methodology of the Performance Evaluation Unit to evaluate the design, processes, results, consistency, and impact of the educational programs of other degree programs, as an element of interest in the follow-up of graduates.

References

- [1]. Astin, A. W. (1993). *What Matters In College? Four Critical Years Revisited*. San Francisco: Josseybass.
- [2]. Bok, D., & Bowen, W. G. (1998). *The Shape Of The River: Long-Term Consequences Of Considering Race In College And University Admissions*. Princeton: Princeton University Press
- [3]. Cabrera, A. F., Weerts, D. J., & Zulick, B. J. (2003). Encuestas A Egresados: Tres Fundamentos Conceptuales En El Seguimiento De Egresados Universitarios. *Métodos De Análisis De La Inserción Laboral De Los Universitarios*, 55, 1234-1242.
- [4]. Cruz, O. A., & Pinto Pérez, R. (2020). Determinantes De La Inserción Laboral En Egresados Universitarios En México. *RIDE. Revista Iberoamericana Para La Investigación Y El Desarrollo Educativo*, 11(21).
- [5]. DIARIO OFICIAL DE LA FEDERACIÓN DOF: 29/12/2020. (Consultado El 16 De Julio 2021). ACUERDO Número 28/12/20 Por El Que Se Emiten Las Reglas De Operación Del Programa Nacional De Inglés Para El Ejercicio Fiscal 2021.
- [6]. Ewell, P. (1996). Identifying Indicators Of Curriculum Quality (Pp. 608-632). In J.G. Gaff And J.L. Ratcliff (Eds.), *Handbook Of The Undergraduate Curriculum: A Comprehensive Guide To Purposes, Structures, Practices, And Change*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

- [7]. Hernández, C. A., Tavera, M. E., & Jiménez, M. (2012). Seguimiento De Egresados En Tres Programas De Maestría En Una Escuela Del Instituto Politécnico Nacional En México. *Formación Universitaria*, 5(2), 41-52.
- [8]. Hernández García, Julissa, & Cruz Villegas, Verónica De La. (2021). La Enseñanza Del Inglés Y El Francés En México. Métodos Y Políticas Públicas. *Dilemas Contemporáneos: Educación, Política Y Valores*, 9(Spe1), 00031. Epub 31 De Enero De 2022. <https://doi.org/10.46377/dilemas.v9i.2937>
- [9]. Kuh, G. D. (2003). What We're Learning About Student Engagement: Benchmarks For Effective Educational Practices. *Change*, 35(2), 24-32.
- [10]. Ley De Educación Superior Publicado En El Diario Oficial De La Federación El 20 De Abril De 2021 Cámara De Diputados Marúm Espinosa, Elia (Especialista Principal) (2016). "Educación Superior En Iberoamérica. Informe Nacional: México." En: Brunner, José Joaquín Y Daniel Andrés Miranda (Editores) (2016). *Educación Superior En Iberoamérica. Informe 2016*. Chile, Centro Interuniversitario De Desarrollo (CINDA)
- [11]. Marúm Espinosa, E., & Rodríguez Armenta, C. (2020). Los Efectos En Las Políticas Públicas Del Gobierno De La Cuarta Transformación En La Educación Superior En México. *Universidades*, 71(86), 88-106. <https://doi.org/10.36888/udual.universidades.2020.86.408>
- [12]. Pascarella, E. T. (2001). Identifying Excellence In Undergraduate Education: Are We Even Close? *Change*, 33(3), 18-23.
- [13]. Pike, G. R. (1993). The Relationship Between Perceived Learning And Satisfaction With College: An Alternative View. *Research In Higher Education*, 34(1), 23-40.
- [14]. Ramírez Romero José Luis (2011) *Los Egresados De Una Licenciatura En Enseñanza Del Inglés: Una Primera Mirada* Revista De La Educación Superior, Versión Impresa ISSN 0185.2760
- [15]. Rogers, P. (2014). *La Teoría Del Cambio. Síntesis Metodológicas: Evaluación De Impacto N.º 2*, Centro De Investigaciones De UNICEF, Florencia.
- [16]. Sánchez, R. F. G., Zermeno, M. A. T., & Preciado, V. H. T. (2016). Análisis De La Satisfacción De La Experiencia Universitaria De Los Egresados En 2015 De La Universidad De Colima. *Paradigma Económico*, 8(2), 59-84.
- [17]. Secretaría De Educación Pública (Junio 7, 2020). Programa Sectorial De Educación 2020-2024. *Diario Oficial De La Federación (DOF)*: 06/07/2020
- [18]. Silva, S. G., Álvarez-Icaza, M. F., Marmolejo, A. C., Machado, P. F., España, A. T., & Reynaga, P. A. R. (2008). Estudio De Seguimiento De Egresados: Recomendaciones Para Su Desarrollo. *Innovación Educativa*, 8(42), 19-31.